

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS
BOSTON DIVISION**

Musket Research Associates, Inc.,

Plaintiff,

v.

Ovion, Inc.,
William S. Tremulis, and
Jeffrey P. Callister,

Defendants.

Case No. 05-10416 MEL

Ovion, Inc.,

Counterclaimant,

v.

Musket Research Associates, Inc.,
David B. Musket, and
Sue Ann Latterman,

Counterdefendants.

AFFIDAVIT OF CHRISTOPHER V. CARANI

I, Christopher V. Carani, depose and say as follows:

1. My name is Christopher V. Carani.
2. I am an attorney licensed to practice in the Illinois Supreme Court, United States District Court for the Northern District of Illinois, and the United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit, and am admitted *pro hac vice* in this action. I am a partner with the law firm of McAndrews, Held & Malloy, Ltd., and counsel for Defendant Ovion, Inc. ("Ovion"), William S. Tremulis and Jeffrey P. Callister. I make this affidavit on my own personal knowledge.

3. I have reviewed documents produced by the parties in this matter. Included in these documents are e-mails.

4. I have identified 232 unique e-mails sent by either David Musket or Sue Ann Latterman to either William S. Tremulis or Jeffrey P. Callister or both during the time period from June 1, 2004 to February 16, 2005.

5. I have also identified 81 additional, unique e-mails sent by David Musket to Sue Ann Latterman or by Sue Ann Latterman to David Musket during the time period from June 1, 2004 to February 16, 2005.

Signed under the penalties of perjury this 3rd day of March, 2006


Christopher V. Carani